

**Chris O'Doherty**  
**RAIB Relationship and Recommendation Handling**  
**Manager**

Telephone: 020 7282 3752

E-mail: [chris.o'doherty@orr.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:chris.o'doherty@orr.gsi.gov.uk)

13 October 2014

Ms Carolyn Griffiths  
Chief Inspector of Rail Accidents  
Cullen House  
Berkshire Copse Rd  
Aldershot  
Hampshire GU11 2HP

Dear Carolyn,

**RAIB Report: Collision at Buttington Hall user worked crossing, Welshpool, 16 July 2013**

I write to report<sup>1</sup> on the consideration given and action taken in respect of the recommendations addressed to ORR in the above report, published on 27 March 2014.

The annex to this letter provides details of the consideration given / action taken in respect of each recommendation:

- The status of recommendations 1, 2 and 3 are 'Implementation On-going'.

ORR will advise RAIB when actions to address these recommendations have been completed.

We will publish this response on the ORR website on 31 October 2014.

Yours Sincerely,

Chris O'Doherty

---

<sup>1</sup> In accordance with Regulation 12(2)(b) of the Railways (Accident Investigation and Reporting) Regulations 2005

## Initial consideration by ORR

1. All 3 recommendations contained in the report were addressed to ORR when RAIB published its report on 27 March 2014.
2. On 14 April 2014 ORR passed recommendations 1 and 2 to Network Rail and recommendation 3 to RSSB asking them to consider and where appropriate act upon them.
3. Details of consideration given and any action taken, in respect of these recommendations are provided below.
4. ORR also brought this report to the attention of the Heritage Rail Association as it was concluded that there are equally important lessons for heritage railways. ORR did not ask the HRA to provide a reply.

## Recommendation 1

*The intent of this recommendation is that main line railway infrastructure managers understand the true risk at times of intensive use of user worked crossings.*

Network Rail and Northern Ireland Railways should review and improve their processes for assessing the risk at user worked crossings so that the increased risk during periods of intensive use (e.g. during harvest) is properly taken into account.

This recommendation may also be applicable to other infrastructure managers.

## Actions being taken to address the recommendation

5. On 20 June 2014, Network Rail provided the following information:

### General summary

*Network Rail will develop a methodology to identify level crossings that are likely to be subject to intensive use, the likely impact of that use and the identification of appropriate risk controls.*

### Action plan

*The action plan for Buttington Hall recommendation 1 will:*

*Develop guidance to enable Level Crossing Managers [LCMs] to identify locations where intensive periods of use occur. This will consist of:*

- *A process for LCMs to follow to include:*
  - *a standard question set / pro forma for information gathering to determine the impact on risk of intense usage and*
  - *using and interpreting the information gathered, the [All Level Crossing Risk Model] ALCRM output and qualitative judgement to enable informed decision making as to the risk controls to be implemented.*

*The guidance will be consulted on within the Route Level Crossing Manager community.*

*When developing the methodology, Network Rail will engage with Northern Ireland Railways and take any of their relevant processes into account. Network Rail will then share the methodology developed with Northern Ireland Railways.*

Notes:

*The process will include proactive measures such as user engagement, deployment of technology to improve census gathering, taking account of [Train Operating Company] TOC reporting and other 'smart' sources of information.*

*To support the embedding of the guidance, tranche 3 of the level crossing safety improvement programme includes work to analyse how intensive use can be better modelled in ALCRM.*

*Timescale: 30 April 2015*

## **ORR decision**

6. After reviewing information received ORR has concluded that, in accordance with the Railways (Accident Investigation and Reporting) Regulations 2005, Network Rail has:

- taken the recommendation into consideration and
- is taking action to implement it by 30 April 2015.

**Status: Implementation on-going.** *ORR will advise RAIB when actions to address this recommendation have been completed.*

## **Recommendation 2**

*The intent of this recommendation is to reduce the risk at user worked crossings during periods of intensive use.*

Network Rail and Northern Ireland Railways should define one or more safe and practical methods of working that may be adopted at user worked crossings during periods of intensive use; and provide clear information to their staff and authorised users on how and when they should be applied. They should also ensure that any such methods of working are suitably reflected in instructions and training given to railway staff.

This recommendation may also be applicable to other infrastructure managers.

## **Actions being taken to address the recommendation**

7. On 20 June 2014, Network Rail provided the following information:

### General summary

*Network Rail will work with a selection of Route teams, external key stakeholders and with the support of Network Operations to develop good practice guidance for use during periods of intensive use of level crossings. This will include associated generic safe methods of working templates(s) which cater for different scenarios and provide guidance for deployment.*

### Action plan

*The action plan for Buttington Hall recommendation 2 will include the development of:*

- *Good practice guidance for application during periods of intensive crossing usage, e.g.*

- *Assessing the method of working and its requirement, (see recommendation 1)*
- *Generic methods of working templates*
- *Form(s) to document agreements amongst affected parties*
- *Advice on engaging with users of user worked crossings or their employees; this includes authorised users, contractors and bodies such as the National Farmers Union (NFU)*
- *Communications to support engagement and promote awareness, e.g. NFU national and local communications*
- *Development work will involve representatives from the operations community*
- *Training and briefing of the guidance and suggested methods of working will be take place within the:*
  - *Level Crossing Manager and*
  - *operations community*

*The development work will take existing good practice established by Route teams. Network Rail will also seek to engage with Northern Ireland Railways in this work.*

*Network Rail will work with industry partners such as the National Farmers Union and Forestry Commission to improve our engagement with users.*

*Note:*

*Engagement has taken place with the NFU in advance of the 2014 harvest season. This initially resulted in the publication of a full page advert in the June edition of the Farmer & Grower magazine to raise awareness of the risks associated with harvest time and encourage engagement with Network Rail. Representatives of the NFU also attended a meeting of the Level Crossing Strategy Group on 22 May to discuss this issue.*

*Timescale: 30 May 2015*

### **ORR decision**

8. After reviewing information received ORR has concluded that, in accordance with the Railways (Accident Investigation and Reporting) Regulations 2005, Network Rail has:

- taken the recommendation into consideration; and
- is taking action to implement it by 30 May 2015.

**Status: Implementation on-going.** *ORR will advise RAIB when actions to address this recommendation have been completed.*

### **Recommendation 3**

*The intent of this recommendation is that the revised method of working devised in response to recommendation 2 is included in the level crossing risk management toolkit as a potential mitigation measure.*

RSSB should review, and improve where appropriate, measures in the level crossing risk management toolkit that are designed to mitigate the risk at user worked crossings at times of intensive use.

## **Actions being taken to address the recommendation**

9. On 22 May 2014, RSSB provided the following information:  
*RSSB is planning to start work on its upgrade of the level crossing risk management toolkit (LXRMTK) in June 2014 and has made its supplier aware of recommendation 3.*

*RSSB will work closely with Network Rail and the supplier for the upgrade to ensure that any mitigation(s) are incorporated within a research project and introduce new mitigation(s), as appropriate, within the LXRMTK.*

*If, for some reason, further mitigation(s) is established after the timescale of the project, the mitigation(s) will be promptly introduced into the LXRMTK when received from Network Rail.*

On 2 July 2014, RSSB provided a timescale to carry out the research project. *The project commenced on 2 July 2014 and RSSB expect to complete a review and have the updated LXRMTK on its website in the first (calendar) quarter of 2015.*

Timescale: 31 March 2015

## **ORR decision**

10. After reviewing information received ORR has concluded that, in accordance with the Railways (Accident Investigation and Reporting) Regulations 2005, Network Rail has:

- taken the recommendation into consideration and
- is taking action to implement it by 31 March 2015.

**Status: Implementation on-going.** *ORR will advise RAIB when actions to address this recommendation have been completed.*