

Chris O'Doherty
RAIB relationship and recommendation handling manager
Tel No: 020 7282 3752
Email: chris.o'doherty@orr.gsi.gov.uk

8 October 2013

Ms Carolyn Griffiths
Chief Inspector of Accidents
RAIB
Cullen House
Berkshire Copse Road
Aldershot
Hampshire GU11 2HP

Dear Carolyn

RAIB report: Partial failure of Bridge 94, Bromsgrove stream

I write to update on the consideration given and actions taken in relation to recommendations 2 and 3 of the above report, published on 22 April 2013 that were addressed to ORR.

The annex to this letter provides the detail of the actions being taken where both recommendations are classed as '**implementation on-going**'. We will confirm to RAIB when all actions are complete.

Yours Sincerely

Chris O'Doherty

Update Response

Recommendation 2

The purpose of this recommendation is to address the risk arising from visual examinations being incomplete as a result of access constraints.

Network Rail should review the ways in which it visually examines those structures which cannot be seen from a safe observation location and where access is constrained. This review should consider the ways in which effective examinations can be carried out, and where this cannot be achieved, alternative measures to manage the risk. Any necessary improvements to the examinations regime identified in the review should be implemented.

Previously reported

1. Network Rail had provided a timescale for carrying out a review, as requested by the recommendation; however ORR was unsighted as to the outcomes of the review and any plans Network Rail may have to implement any improvements identified. ORR requested further information which is included below.

Update

2. The response below was received from Network Rail on 15 April 2013

Network Rail have completed a Review of Examination Report Contents focussing on 'what constitutes a complete examination', please refer to report ref: 19633/Rep/Kmcl/2012). The report is in final draft status with a final review/approval meeting currently scheduled for 15 February 2013. Summarised below are recommendations from the report for dealing with structures that cannot be visually examined from a safe location and where access is constrained;

1. Currently, the complete examination field on the front page of the report is the sole indication of whether the examination has been carried out to the extent and standard required. A new and separate data field will report whether the examination is complete in the eyes of CARRS. This will allow Network Rail to manage the implications of any shortfall, for example by instructing further examination.

2. All parts not examined, partially examined or not examined to the required standard will be clearly identified on the front page of the examination report.

3. All parts not examined, partially examined or not examined to the required standard, will be added to the defect tracker and these parts will be tracked as a 'risk' to structures management, until they are examined to the required standard and can be removed from the tracker

Ultimately, where adopted, the recommendations made in the report will be incorporated into the functional requirements of the 'Civils Earthworks Structures Asset Management System (CESAMS) and integrated into future examination framework contracts.

Until the rollout of CESAMS, the recommendations put forward in the report will be accessed and implemented utilising the following interim measures: -

- a) Network Rail intends to undertake a practical field trial to assess the effectiveness of the proposed revised examination templates. Our existing examiners will be utilised to ensure the revised template suitably captures all required data to ensure visual examinations are completed satisfactorily.*
- b) Network Rail will look to develop the handheld collection devices currently utilised on all routes for the collection of visual examination data. The possibility of updating the device software will be explored to include the additional data fields as identified in the report.*
- c) Once the examination report is finalised, the findings of the examination review and all recommendations to be adopted will be briefed to all routes/CEFA managers for immediate implementation.*

Network Rail also has initiated the 'Asset Bridging Tool' tactical solution (The Bridge). This database enables examiners to highlight specific asset components as 'Not examined' which in turn enables informed management actions to be initiated by the engineer reviewing the examination.

3. On 31 July 2013 Network Rail provided further information. The above actions had informed the revised technical specification, currently being utilised to tender for the next Examination Framework Contract. The actions centre on report No 19633/Rep/Kmcl/2012 produced by Lloyds Register Rail (Annex B) on behalf of Network Rail. The report was commissioned to look at long term measures to improve clarity and consistency of both visual and detailed examinations. The report recommended the adoption of new reporting templates and advocated the use of positive nil return (as undertaken in the Wales trial). The report is attached.

4. Until the procurement of the new examination contract utilising the proposed revised examination templates, Guidance document 2013-GN-002-CAR Visual Examinations (Annex C), was produced, in June 2013, to provide clarification on the use of existing visual examination templates to clearly indicate that all observable components of a structure have been viewed during a visual exam. The guidance note also details how components which have not been examined should be recorded to enable suitable risk mitigation to be implemented; the guidance note is attached for information.

The guidance note 2013-GN-002-CAR is being piloted in the Wales Route to the following programme

10 – 15 visual examinations undertaken	July to September 2013
Wales Route and HQ review of initial examinations, lessons learned and revise guidance as necessary	October 2013
Wales route to undertake a further 10-15 visual examinations using revised guidance.	November to December 2013
Review second phase findings	January 2014
Dissemination of lessons learned and review and revise guidance in preparation of national rollout /or integration into future examinations framework technical specification.	February to March 2014.

On 4 September 2013 Network Rail confirmed that tender returns for the replacement contract to Civil Engineering Framework Agreement which covers all Network Rail examination and assessment processes have been received and evaluation was due to be concluded in September. The contract is expected to be awarded by 31 December 2013 with a start date of 1 April 2014.

ORR decision

5. ORR in reviewing the information received from Network Rail has concluded that in accordance with the Railway (Accident Investigation and Reporting) Regulations 2005, it has:

- taken the recommendation into consideration; and
- is taking action to implement it.

Status – *Implementation on-going*, completion date 1 April 2014

Recommendation 3

The purpose of this recommendation is to enhance the information available to staff reviewing examination reports.

Network Rail should improve reference information available to those responsible for reviewing structures examination reports, to enhance the accuracy and effectiveness of the report review and evaluation processes.

Previously reported

Network Rail had provided short term and long term actions and a timetable for carrying out those actions. The actions described are expected to assist in examinations but Network Rail had not addressed how it will improve the information available to those responsible for reviewing structures examinations report

Update

The additional information below was provided by Network Rail in February 2013

Network Rail is proposing improvements to the existing examination report template (see Recommendation 2 paragraph 3) in order to assist those responsible for reviewing structure examination reports. The improvements currently being considered are

- *All parts not examined to the required standard will be clearly identified on the front page of the report*
- *All parts not examined to the required standard will be added to the defect tracker, which becomes a 'risk register'. These parts are tracked as 'risk' to structures management until they are examined to the required standard and can be removed from the tracker*
- *A name of part list will be included in the visual examination report. It will not summarise condition, as it does in the detailed examination report. It will identify which elements of the structure should be examined and which elements are non-examinable in a routine visual examination.*

Additionally, a new Civils Earthworks Structures Asset Management System (CESAMS) is in development as a replacement for CARRS. CESAMS will provide a single repository for all structures data thus improving collation of reference material.

On 4 September 2013 Network Rail confirmed that development processes for CESAMS are underway. Dependent on business readiness the aim is a go live date between 1 April 2014 and 30 June 2014

ORR decision

ORR in reviewing the information received from Network Rail has concluded that in accordance with the Railway (Accident Investigation and Reporting) Regulations 2005, it has:

- taken the recommendation into consideration; and
- is taking action to implement it.

Status – Implementation on-going, completion date 30 June 2014.